

# Minutes

## Transport and Environment Committee

**2.00pm, Friday 19 February 2021**

### Present

Councillors Macinnes (Convener), Doran (Vice-Convener), Bird, Cameron (substituting for Councillor Arthur), Corbett, Key, Lang, Miller, Rose (substituting for Councillor Smith), Smith, Webber and Whyte.

### 1. Minutes

---

#### Decision

The Convener noted that she made a comment at the Transport and Environment Committee of 28 January 2021 (reconvened on 5 February 2021) in relation to Councillor Lang's motion. The Convener advised that the comment was to support what Councillor Lang had said at that point that there was a desire to look from within the community at the issue, the possibility of road closures in the Cammo area in order to reflect both sides of that conversation to take that forward. Councillor Macinnes advised that she made a comment that she had received a representation from the local MP representing a local group of residents who were opposed to the possibility of it. Councillor Macinnes noted her wording could have been read differently than was intended but the comment was intended to indicate that there were two sides to the discussion and that Committee would need to take that in to account as had been outlined by Councillor Lang in his motion. Any impression that the local MP was coming down on one side of the argument or the other was incorrect and the Convener requested this be recorded as such.

### 2. City Mobility Plan

---

#### a) Deputation – Edinburgh City Private Hire Ltd and Seven Sevens Cars Ltd

A written deputation was presented on behalf of Edinburgh City Private Hire Ltd and Seven Sevens Cars Ltd.

The deputation requested that the Committee amended the detail of the City Mobility Plan by:

(a) replacing the word "taxi" or "taxis" with the phrase "Taxi and Private Hire Taxi" or "Taxis and Private Hire Taxis as appropriate, at pages 24, 26, 34, 39, 46 and 52 of the Plan; and

(b) including reference to “Private Hire Taxi drop off and pick up areas” in Policy Measure MOVEMENT 3 and as one of the key measures in Mobility Hubs on page 35;

The deputation advised that these changes were required to clarify that a Private Hire Taxi provided the same function as a Taxi in Transport sustainability terms. It ensured the Private Hire Taxi industry would have access to the same level of partnership working with the Council as other Taxis and ensured that both classes of vehicle description could contribute to the fulfilment of the Council’s ongoing strategy of the City Mobility Plan 2030.

**b) Deputation – New Town and Broughton Community Council**

A written deputation was presented on behalf of New Town and Broughton Community Council

The deputation welcomed the City Mobility Plan (Plan). The deputation stated that, as always there were some areas where greater detail and clearer targets would be beneficial if only as a means of allowing the Council and others to monitor progress against the Plan. The lack of confirmed funding for much of the Plan raised significant concerns. Without the necessary investment it would not be possible to deliver the modal changes anticipated in the Plan. The deputation provided comments to the earlier draft of the City Mobility Plan last year and provided additional comments.

**c) Deputation – Newington Hotels Group**

A written deputation was presented on behalf of Newington Hotels Group

The deputation was concerned with the potential impacts of ‘eyesore’ infrastructure on tourism. The deputation asked Committee to consider infrastructure changes which allowed the city to meet its zero carbon goals whilst not compromising on the unique character of Edinburgh.

**d) Deputation – Gilmerton Local Residents**

A written deputation was presented on behalf of Gilmerton Local Residents.

The deputation advised that, following the implementation of Safer Streets to Gilmerton Primary School on the 2nd of March 2020 a number of concerns had been voiced by teaching staff/Leadership team and also parents, residents and the pupils. The deputation set out their concerns and listed a number of measures to increase awareness in the area.

**e) Deputation – Gilmerton and Inch Community Council**

A written deputation was presented on behalf of Gilmerton and Inch Community Council.

**Friday, 19th February, 2021**

The deputation was supporting the timed closure of Moredun Dykes Road in compliance with the Safe to Schools Scheme. The deputation noted that since inception this scheme had not worked in Moredun Dykes Road as the vehicular traffic either had no knowledge that the road was actually supposed to be closed at certain times of the day or they chose to ignore the fact. The deputation noted that signage was inadequate and that the double yellow lines that were planned for all the surrounding street corners were not installed. The deputation requested that this was rectified.

**f) Deputation – Gilmerton Primary Parent Council**

A written deputation was presented on behalf of Gilmerton Primary Parent Council.

The deputation advised that, following several years of Parents, Guardians and Residents raising valid concerns about road safety on Moredun Dykes Road, an open meeting was held at Gilmerton Primary School on Monday 18th June 2018 from 5pm – 6.30pm, hosted by an Edinburgh City Council representative. The deputation sought proactive and early engagement from the relevant officials / parties concerned to discuss how matters could now be taken forward in a positive and constructive manner.

**g) Report by the Executive Director of Place**

The City Mobility Plan (CMP) and the associated Implementation Plan, which reflected the level of intervention needed to deliver a more sustainable, integrated, efficient, safe and inclusive transport system over the next 10 years was set out.

**Motion**

- 1) To note that engagement with key stakeholders, including the public, since 2018 had informed the final City Mobility Plan (CMP) which was presented for consideration.
- 2) To acknowledge that engagement on the Draft City Mobility Plan was undertaken in parallel with Choices for City Plan 2030, Edinburgh City Centre Transformation (ECCT) and a Low Emission Zone (LEZ) scheme during its earlier stages of development.
- 3) To approve the final CMP and associated Implementation Plan1.
- 4) To note that, subject to CMP approval, the 'Path to 2030' and the Implementation Plan would be reviewed once a more settled position was reached with respect to COVID-19 and that thereafter, the Implementation Plan would be reviewed every two years, or as circumstances required.
- 5) To note that the City Mobility Plan consultation highlighted support for continuing the conversation around the South Suburban Line for sustainable passenger rail travel.

**Friday, 19th February, 2021**

- 6) To ask that Officers liaised with Transport Scotland and Network Rail, and reported to Committee within 2 cycles on the possibilities surrounding the South Suburban Line being considered for use.
- moved by Councillor Macinnes, seconded by Councillor Doran

In accordance with Standing Order 22(12), paragraphs 5 and 6 of the motion were accepted as an addendum to Amendment 1.

### **Amendment 1**

Committee notes the report by the Executive Director of Place and replaces the recommendations with the following:

- 1) To note that engagement with key stakeholders, including the public, since 2018 had informed the final City Mobility Plan (CMP) which was presented for consideration.
- 2) To note that engagement with the Council's key stakeholders to inform the City Mobility Plan (CMP) concluded in January 2020 having commenced in 2018 and was carried out predominantly alongside the Choices for City Plan 2030 and that the data and opinions presented were therefore all from the pre-Covid 19 era.
- 3) To further note that there was no evidence or research yet available as to how the city may recover post-Covid 19 in terms of commuting and working from home, accessing retail, accessing leisure, hospitality and tourism, all of which could dramatically contribute to shifts in travel patterns, congestion, commuter behaviour and use of public spaces and that greater opportunities to work from home would reduce the need to travel for work.
- 4) To regret that repeated calls from the Conservative Group for credible financial detail around CMP projects had gone unheeded, rendering the document little more than a 'wish list' lacking a robust path to delivery, with no ability to gauge costs and ultimately risk to the Council and the taxpayers we serve. To consider this particularly concerning given the unprecedented financial situation our city faces as we seek to recover from the pandemic. Therefore, to agree that all future projects must not only attract appropriate capital funding from Government but be able to pay for their running and maintenance costs with robust and post-Covid 19 relevant business cases.
- 5) To regrets that the objectives of the CMP were not backed by clear indications of expected or desired modal shift and modal space allocations and that, without this, it was impossible for citizens to assess whether the implications were acceptable in terms of restrictions and changes to their mobility and delivery services (both likely to be provided through electric vehicles within the lifetime of the CMP), the impact that a "to not through" policy for the City Centre might have in limiting their journey choices and damaging public transport , and the impact that the measures in the CMP might have in generating further

“engineered” congestion. Therefore, to agree that the document could be supported without these being clearly set out.

- 6) To note the continued willingness of our city’s residents and commuters to use sustainable travel methods with 69% and 82% using these means to get to work and education or for of 2 local journeys respectively; that Edinburgh had the lowest bus fares in Scotland; and that Lothian Buses’ extensive network already provided an excellent service to areas of multiple deprivation. Therefore, to agree that there was an over emphasis on “poverty and inequality” in the report in suggesting a substantial redistributive shift in taxation and spending that was unaffordable to the Council and outwith the scope of its Transport powers. Therefore, to agree that this was a matter for Government as it would require further debate, budgeting and decision making at a national level.
- 7) To acknowledge that the CMP was inextricably linked to the City Plan 2030 and must, therefore, sit within it in order to support and create further efficiencies in Senior Officer effectiveness, avoid duplication, and streamline governance. This would make the Council’s spatial strategy clearer and more coherent and reduce the risk of contradiction within the Council.
- 8) To note with concern that many of the previous SfP schemes classified as unworkable have been transferred to Places for Everyone as outlined in 4.15 of the report.
- 9) To agree to migrate the CMP to be a subsidiary component to the City Plan 2030 in order to provide the time needed to re-assess the changing city landscape, amend our post-covid priorities accordingly and provide the crucial financial detail needed for Councillors to make costed, evidence-based decisions and provide best-value for public funds as a result of revised version of City Plan 2030.
- 10) To Include private hire taxis along with taxis as part of the public transport offering of the city

- moved by Councillor Webber, seconded by Councillor Whyte

## **Amendment 2**

Delete 1.1.3 and 1.1.4 and insert:

- 1) To note that engagement with key stakeholders, including the public, since 2018 had informed the final City Mobility Plan (CMP) which was presented for consideration.
- 2) To acknowledge that engagement on the Draft City Mobility Plan was undertaken in parallel with Choices for City Plan 2030, Edinburgh City Centre Transformation (ECCT) and a Low Emission Zone (LEZ) scheme during its earlier stages of development.

- 3) To welcome the broad vision and three overarching objectives set out in the mobility plan but believed the plan could be improved through:
    - 3.1) SMART measures and targets to clearly determine success.
    - 3.2) an additional section setting out the broad estimated financial requirements and resource implications given the plan was to be delivered at a time of strained council budgets.
    - 3.3) a clearer sense of prioritisation between the 49 different policy measures given available resources may mean choices may have to made.
    - 3.4) a clear timetabled delivery plan for at least the next two years.
    - 3.5) a firm commitment to both the south suburban rail line and Dalmeny chord as a way of increasing city rail capacity.
    - 3.6) a stronger ambition to expand existing and create new transport hubs, rather than the stated policy to just 'investigate opportunities.
  - 4) To therefore agree to continue approval of the overall plan until these additional details were provided and amendments made.
- moved by Councillor Lang, seconded by Councillor Rose

### **Amendment 3**

- 1) To note that engagement with key stakeholders, including the public, since 2018 had informed the final City Mobility Plan (CMP) which was presented for consideration.
- 2) To acknowledge that engagement on the Draft City Mobility Plan was undertaken in parallel with Choices for City Plan 2030, Edinburgh City Centre Transformation (ECCT) and a Low Emission Zone (LEZ) scheme during its earlier stages of development.
- 3) To approve the final CMP and associated Implementation Plan1.
- 4) To note that, subject to CMP approval, the 'Path to 2030' and the Implementation Plan would be reviewed once a more settled position was reached with respect to COVID-19 and that thereafter, the Implementation Plan would be reviewed every two years, or as circumstances required.
- 5) To note that the City Mobility Plan consultation highlighted support for continuing the conversation around the South Suburban Line for sustainable passenger rail travel.
- 6) To ask that Officers liaised with Transport Scotland and Network Rail, and reported to Committee within 2 cycles on the possibilities surrounding the South Suburban Line being considered for use.7) To call for officers to reflect

development of national transport strategy and priorities at the first major review of the City Mobility Plan.

- moved by Councillor Miller, seconded by Councillor Corbett

In accordance with Standing Order 22(12), Amendment 3 was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

### **Voting**

The voting was as follows:

For the motion (as adjusted) - 7 votes

For Amendment 1 - 3 votes

For Amendment 2 - 1 vote

(For the motion (as adjusted) – Councillors Bird, Cameron, Corbett, Doran, Key, Macinnes and Miller

For Amendment 1 – Councillors Rose, Webber and Whyte

For Amendment 2 – Councillor Lang)

### **Decision**

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Macinnes:

- 1) To note that engagement with key stakeholders, including the public, since 2018 had informed the final City Mobility Plan (CMP) which was presented for consideration.
- 2) To acknowledge that engagement on the Draft City Mobility Plan was undertaken in parallel with Choices for City Plan 2030, Edinburgh City Centre Transformation (ECCT) and a Low Emission Zone (LEZ) scheme during its earlier stages of development.
- 3) To approve the final CMP and associated Implementation Plan1.
- 4) To note that, subject to CMP approval, the 'Path to 2030' and the Implementation Plan would be reviewed once a more settled position was reached with respect to COVID-19 and that thereafter, the Implementation Plan would be reviewed every two years, or as circumstances required.
- 5) To note that the City Mobility Plan consultation highlighted support for continuing the conversation around the South Suburban Line for sustainable passenger rail travel.
- 6) To ask that Officers liaised with Transport Scotland and Network Rail, and reported to Committee within 2 cycles on the possibilities surrounding the South Suburban Line being considered for use.

**Friday, 19th February, 2021**

- 7) To call for officers to reflect development of national transport strategy and priorities at the first major review of the City Mobility Plan.

(References – Policy and Sustainability Committee, 1 December 2020 (item 7); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted.)

### **Declaration of Interests**

Councillor Macinnes declared a non-financial interest in the above item as Chair of Transport for Edinburgh.

Councillors Doran and Miller declared a non-financial interest in the above item as Directors of Transport for Edinburgh.

### **3. Valedictory Remarks**

---

The Committee recorded thanks to Will Garrett and Ewan Kennedy for their work and commitment during their tenure in the roles of Team Manager (Planning: Spatial Policy: City Wide Team) and Policy & Planning Manager (Network) respectively and wished them well for the future.